



## Assessing the Effectiveness of Online Learning Resources in Academic Libraries in Higher Education

Dr. Rukshanda Zarar<sup>1</sup>, Farah Naseer<sup>2\*</sup>, Zubair Ahmed<sup>3</sup>

### Abstract

This qualitative research explores student perspectives on online learning resources within the academic libraries of Pakistani universities. Through in-depth interviews with undergraduate and postgraduate students, the study identified five key themes: accessibility and usability, cultural considerations and customization, impact on the learning experience, challenges faced by students, and recommendations for improvement. The findings align with previous research, emphasizing the significance of addressing technical challenges, promoting cultural customization, and fostering collaboration among universities. Participants highlighted the pivotal role of accessibility and usability in shaping their experiences, calling for user-friendly interfaces and optimized resources. Cultural considerations emerged as a crucial factor, emphasizing the need for customization to align with local context and diversity. The impact on the overall learning experience revealed a nuanced relationship, with positive aspects of flexibility tempered by challenges related to curriculum alignment. Challenges faced by students included technical issues and the absence of a standardized approach across universities. Proactive recommendations included targeted training programs and collaborative efforts among universities. This study contributes valuable insights for educators, administrators, and policymakers seeking to enhance the effectiveness of online learning resources in the diverse and evolving landscape of Pakistani university libraries.

**Keywords:** Online Learning Resources, Student Perspectives, Academic Libraries, Accessibility, Cultural Customization, Learning Experience, Challenges, Recommendations, Higher Education, Pakistani Universities

### 1. Introduction

In recent years, Pakistan's higher education landscape has undergone a profound transformation, marked by a substantial integration of technology (Akram et al., 2021). The conventional teaching methods are giving way to a more tech-savvy approach, with the advent of e-learning platforms, virtual classrooms, and the digitization of libraries (Akram & Abdelrady, 2023; Abdelrady & Akram, 2022). This shift not only enhances accessibility to education, particularly in remote areas but also fosters interactive and collaborative learning experiences. Artificial Intelligence (AI) is also playing a pivotal role in personalizing education, catering to individual student needs. While challenges like the digital divide persist, the opportunities presented by this technological integration hold the promise of a more inclusive and forward-thinking educational system in Pakistan (Akram et al., 2022). Besides, there is a notable shift towards the integration of online learning resources within the academic libraries of its universities (Tabassum et al., 2022). This evolution represents more than a mere change in approach; it signifies a fundamental reimagining of how knowledge is accessed and disseminated in a digitally driven era (Ullah et al., 2021). While challenges like the digital divide persist, the opportunities presented by this technological integration hold the promise of a more inclusive and forward-thinking educational system in Pakistan (Akram et al., 2021).

The surge in online learning resources is not a fleeting trend but a strategic response to the changing dynamics of education. Academic libraries, once characterized by physical collections and study spaces, have adapted to the digital age (Brundy, 2015). E-books, scholarly databases, virtual classrooms, and multimedia materials have become integral components, transcending the constraints of traditional learning methods (Abubakar, 2021). Assessing the effectiveness of these resources necessitates a thorough examination of their accessibility and inclusivity (Awoyemi & Awoyemi, 2021). In a country marked by diverse demographics and varying technological infrastructures, ensuring equitable access to these tools becomes a paramount concern. Issues such as internet connectivity, device availability, and digital literacy come to the forefront, demanding a nuanced understanding of how these resources either bridge or widen existing educational disparities (Martzoukou, 2021).

The Pakistani academic landscape, with its unique challenges, adds layer of complexity to this evaluation. Socioeconomic factors, regional disparities, and cultural nuances shape the adoption and impact of digital tools. Grasping these challenges is vital for tailoring strategies that address the specific needs of Pakistani students and educators. According to Akram (2020) and Akram and Yang (2021), as educational policies and practices continue to adapt to this technological revolution, a holistic approach is crucial to ensure an inclusive and effective educational system. While challenges like the digital divide persist, the opportunities presented by this technological integration hold the promise of a more inclusive and forward-thinking educational system in Pakistan.

<sup>1</sup> Social Work Department, Sardar Bahadur Khan Women's University, Quetta, Baluchistan

<sup>2</sup> Lecturer in Sociology, Sardar Bahadur Khan Women's University, Quetta, Baluchistan, [Farahnaseer@gmail.com](mailto:Farahnaseer@gmail.com)

<sup>3</sup> University of Karachi

Delving into the pedagogical implications of online learning resources is equally critical. How do these tools influence traditional teaching methods? What impact do they have on student engagement, critical thinking, and collaborative learning? Understanding the pedagogical underpinnings provides insights into the efficacy of these resources in the Pakistani educational context. Looking towards the future, it is essential to consider how academic libraries in Pakistani universities can optimize the impact of online learning resources. The role of emerging technologies, such as artificial intelligence and virtual reality, needs exploration to further enhance the educational experience. Contemplating these aspects not only refines the current usage of digital tools but also envisions a future where they revolutionize knowledge acquisition and sharing in the pursuit of academic excellence.

In this intricate tapestry of technological integration and educational evolution, the effectiveness of online learning resources in Pakistani universities emerges as a compelling subject of exploration. This journey involves navigating challenges, understanding cultural nuances, and envisioning a future where digital resources redefine how knowledge is acquired and shared in the pursuit of academic excellence. In this regard, the current study examined these research questions:

1. How do students in Pakistani universities perceive the accessibility and usability of online learning resources within academic libraries?
2. What are the student perspectives on the impact of online learning resources on their overall learning experience, including aspects like engagement, critical thinking, and collaborative learning, within the unique socio-cultural context of Pakistani academia?

## 2. Literature Review

The integration of online learning resources within academic libraries has become a focal point in the educational discourse, especially in the context of Pakistani universities. This literature review aims to explore previous studies that delve into various aspects of online learning resources, providing insights into their effectiveness and impact on students in the Pakistani academic landscape.

The studies conducted by Mahmood (2021) and Farooq et al. (2020) provide valuable insights into the challenges associated with the accessibility and usability of online learning resources in Pakistani universities. Mahmood's (2021) research sheds light on issues concerning internet connectivity and digital literacy, underscoring the critical need for infrastructure development to overcome these barriers. Farooq et al.'s (2020) work extends this discussion, emphasizing the significance of user-friendly interfaces and the availability of devices to ensure equitable access to online education. Together, these studies highlight the multifaceted nature of challenges faced by students and educators, ranging from fundamental issues like internet connectivity and digital literacy to the importance of creating user-friendly platforms. Addressing these challenges is pivotal for creating a more inclusive and effective online learning environment in Pakistani universities.

In delving into student perspectives on online learning resources within Pakistani universities, the research conducted by Noor et al. (2020) emerges as a significant contribution. The findings of the study indicate a generally positive perception among students, highlighting their appreciation for the flexibility and convenience offered by online learning. However, it also brings attention to concerns regarding the adaptability of certain resources to the local curriculum and language preferences. This nuanced exploration underscores the need for a careful balance in incorporating online resources, ensuring that while the advantages of flexibility are maintained, the content remains relevant and tailored to the unique academic and linguistic context of Pakistani students. These insights provide a valuable foundation for educators and policymakers seeking to refine and optimize the online learning experience to better suit the needs of the diverse student population in the country.

Understanding the socio-cultural implications of online learning resources is imperative in the Pakistani context. Shah et al. (2021) and Iqbal et al. (2022) studies delved into the cultural nuances affecting the adoption of digital tools in academic settings. The research highlighted the need for resource customization to align with cultural sensitivities and regional diversity, emphasizing that a one-size-fits-all approach may not be effective.

The exploration of the pedagogical implications of online learning resources was undertaken by Abid et al. (2021) and Mustafa et al. (2021), shedding light on the transformative effects on both teaching methodologies and student learning outcomes. Abid et al. (2021) delved into how these resources influence teaching methodologies, emphasizing the necessity for continuous faculty development to optimize their utilization. The study highlights the evolving role of educators in adapting to online resources and underscores the importance of providing them with the necessary skills and training. In parallel, Mustafa et al.'s (2021) work offers insights into the impact of online learning resources on student learning outcomes, revealing correlations between effective resource integration and enhanced critical thinking skills. These studies collectively emphasize the dynamic relationship between educators, students, and online resources, underscoring the need for ongoing professional development and strategic integration of these tools to foster a more enriching and effective educational experience in Pakistani universities. Ramzan et al. (2023) have confirmed

there are not any significant statistical differences among ESL motivational gender levels. Chen and Ramzan (2024) have further stated that Facebook posts about learning English as a second language (L2) provide primary motivation for learners and promote their performance.

The literature review underscores the multifaceted nature of assessing online learning resources in Pakistani university libraries. While strides have been made in acknowledging their potential, challenges related to accessibility, cultural considerations, and pedagogical impact persist. Building upon these studies, the present research aims to contribute to this evolving conversation, offering a nuanced understanding of how online learning resources shape the educational landscape in Pakistani universities.

### **3. Methodology**

This study employed qualitative research, we aimed to explore student views on online learning resources through in-depth interviews. This approach allowed for a rich understanding of the experiences, perceptions, and challenges faced by students in the context of Pakistani university libraries (Marshall & Rossman, 2014).

We employed a purposive sampling technique to select participants who were undergraduate and postgraduate students from diverse disciplines across multiple universities in Pakistan. The selection ensured representation based on academic backgrounds (Campbell et al., 2020), experiences with online resources, and demographic diversity and 24 students were selected to conduct interviews.

#### **3.1. Data Collection**

In-depth, semi-structured interviews were conducted with participants, allowing for open-ended questions and follow-up probes (Adams, 2015). The interview guide covered themes such as accessibility, usability, cultural considerations, and the impact of online learning resources on the overall learning experience.

To enhance the credibility of the findings, a participant validation process was incorporated. Participants were allowed to review and validate the initial findings, ensuring that their perspectives were accurately represented (Rabionet, 2011).

#### **3.2. Data Analysis**

Thematic analysis was employed to identify patterns, recurring themes, and meaningful insights within the interview transcripts. The data were coded, categorized, and organized into themes, providing a comprehensive understanding of the participants' perspectives.

The researcher's reflexivity was acknowledged throughout the analysis process. Reflective notes were maintained to document the researcher's biases and perspectives, ensuring transparency and rigor in the interpretation of the data.

#### **3.3. Ethical Considerations**

Ethical approval was obtained from relevant institutional review boards. Informed consent was secured from all participants, emphasizing the voluntary nature of participation, confidentiality, and the option to withdraw at any stage without repercussions (Arifin, 2018).

#### **3.4. Rigor and Trustworthiness**

To ensure the rigor and trustworthiness of the study, we considered established qualitative research criteria, such as dependability, confirmability, and transferability (Horton et al., 2004). Detailed documentation of the research process and decisions made during analysis was maintained.

### **4. Results**

The interviews revealed following key themes:

#### **4.1. Accessibility and Usability**

Students consistently highlighted the crucial role of accessibility and usability in shaping their experiences with online learning resources. Challenges related to internet connectivity, device availability, and digital literacy emerged as significant factors influencing how accessible and user-friendly these resources were perceived to be. Some of the participants mentioned that:

"Honestly, the online resources are great, but the struggle with slow internet and sometimes not having the right device can be frustrating. It's like you have this treasure trove of knowledge, but the key sometimes doesn't fit."

"Yeah, and not everyone has the latest gadgets. It would be better if the resources were designed to work smoothly on simpler devices. That way, everyone gets a fair shot."

#### **4.2. Cultural Considerations and Customization**

A prominent theme that surfaced in the interviews was the importance of considering cultural nuances in the design and implementation of online learning resources. Participants emphasized the need for customization to align with cultural sensitivities and regional diversity. This theme shed light on the necessity of adapting digital tools to the unique sociocultural context of Pakistani academia. A few participants said:

"I feel like sometimes the content doesn't really resonate with our local context. It's like they copy-paste from international sources without considering our specific needs and perspectives."

"Absolutely! If they could customize the resources to align with our culture and languages, it would make a huge difference. Learning would feel more relevant and engaging."

#### **4.3. Impact on Learning Experience**

The impact of online learning resources on the overall learning experience emerged as a central theme. Students expressed varying degrees of positive experiences, citing increased flexibility, convenience, and access to a wealth of information. However, challenges such as adaptability to local curriculum and language preferences were also highlighted, suggesting a nuanced relationship between these resources and the learning journey. Some of the participants mentioned that:

"I love the flexibility online resources offer. I can study at my own pace, and there's so much information available. It's like having the library at my fingertips."

"But there are times when it's overwhelming. The materials don't always match what we're studying in class, and that can be confusing. It's a bit of a double-edged sword."

#### **4.4. Challenges Faced by Students**

Interviews revealed a range of challenges faced by students when utilizing online learning resources. Technical issues, lack of proper training, and the absence of a standardized approach across different universities were commonly cited challenges. Additionally, concerns regarding the potential for increased academic disparities due to varying access to digital resources were voiced by participants. A few participants said:

"The tech issues can be a nightmare. Imagine being in the middle of an online lecture, and suddenly your internet decides to play hide and seek. It's stressful!"

"And not everyone is tech-savvy. Some of my friends struggle with the platforms, and there's not enough support. A standardized approach across universities could really help."

#### **4.5. Recommendations for Improvement**

A recurring theme in the interviews was the participants' proactive suggestions for enhancing the effectiveness of online learning resources. Recommendations included targeted training programs for students and faculty, infrastructure development to address connectivity issues, and collaborative efforts among universities to create a standardized framework for the integration of digital tools. This theme provided valuable insights into the aspirations of students for an improved online learning environment. Some of the participants mentioned that:

"I think universities should provide more training on how to use these resources effectively. It's not just about having access; it's about knowing how to make the most of it."

"And there should be collaboration among universities. Why reinvent the wheel? If we had a standardized system, it would be so much easier for everyone."

These five key themes encapsulate the multifaceted nature of student perspectives on online learning resources in Pakistani university libraries. While acknowledging the positive aspects, the study also sheds light on the challenges faced by students and offers actionable recommendations for optimizing the design and implementation of these resources in the future.

## **5. Discussion**

The research findings, echoing the works of Walsh and Rana (2020) and Ashiq et al. (2021), underscore the paramount importance of accessibility and usability in shaping student experiences within the evolving landscape of higher education in Pakistan. The challenges posed by internet connectivity issues and device compatibility highlight the urgent need for infrastructure development and resource optimization. It becomes imperative for library administrators and policymakers to prioritize the incorporation of user-friendly interfaces that align with the diverse technological landscapes prevalent among students.

Concurrently, our study aligns with the insights presented by Martin et al. (2020), emphasizing the pivotal role of cultural considerations in the effective utilization of online learning resources. The call for customization to cater to local needs and sensitivities resonates with previous research, emphasizing the significance of adapting digital tools to the unique sociocultural context of Pakistani academia. This recurrent theme reinforces the idea that a one-size-fits-all approach may not effectively serve the diverse student population, necessitating a nuanced and culturally sensitive approach in the integration of technology in higher education policies and practices.

The nuanced perspectives on the impact of online learning resources on the overall learning experience align seamlessly with Chiu's (2022) research, providing a comprehensive understanding of the evolving educational landscape. The positive aspects, such as enhanced flexibility and access to a wealth of information, resonate with Chiu's findings, suggesting that these benefits are consistent across diverse educational settings. However, the challenges related to aligning digital resources with the local curriculum and language preferences echo concerns raised in previous studies. This underscores the complexity of integrating global educational content into the local academic context, necessitating a careful balance. Striking this equilibrium is crucial for ensuring that online learning

resources not only provide flexibility and a vast pool of information but also remain relevant and tailored to the unique needs of the local student population. The study emphasizes the importance of a thoughtful and context-aware approach in leveraging the potential of online learning resources for an enriched educational experience.

Our research findings align closely with the challenges highlighted by Barrot et al. (2021) and Besser et al. (2022), shedding light on prevalent issues such as technical obstacles, insufficient training, and the lack of a standardized approach across universities. These challenges, if unaddressed, have the potential to exacerbate academic disparities among students. Recognizing the importance of overcoming these hurdles becomes paramount, calling for concerted efforts among universities to establish a cohesive and supportive online learning environment. The significance of a collaborative approach lies in its potential to not only enhance the quality of online education but also bridge the gaps in technical proficiency and access to resources, ensuring a more equitable learning experience for all students, regardless of their academic backgrounds. This collaborative effort can pave the way for a more inclusive and effective online education system in Pakistan.

Our study, aligning with the proactive recommendations voiced by participants, resonates with the sentiments expressed by Li and Akram (2023) regarding the imperative need for targeted teacher training programs in the context of evolving online education. The call for collaboration among universities, echoing the work of Mahmood (2021), underlines the importance of adopting a unified approach to maximize the effectiveness of online learning resources. These recommendations collectively offer actionable insights for educators, administrators, and policymakers striving to optimize the online learning landscape in Pakistan. By prioritizing targeted teacher training and fostering collaboration among academic institutions, stakeholders can contribute significantly to the enhancement of the overall quality and accessibility of online education, ensuring a more robust and inclusive learning experience for students across the nation.

## 6. Conclusion

In conclusion, our exploration into student perspectives on online learning resources within Pakistani university libraries reveals a dynamic interplay of challenges and opportunities. The identified themes, ranging from accessibility and usability to cultural considerations, underscore the need for a nuanced and context-specific approach. The findings align with previous studies, emphasizing the importance of addressing technical challenges, promoting cultural customization, and fostering collaboration among universities. By heeding the recommendations put forth by participants, educators, administrators, and policymakers can contribute to the creation of a more adaptive, inclusive, and effective online learning environment tailored to the unique needs of Pakistani students.

## 7. Limitations

Despite the valuable insights gained from this study, it is essential to acknowledge its limitations. Firstly, the qualitative nature of the research, while providing depth, may limit the generalizability of the findings. The sample size, although diverse, might not fully represent the entirety of student experiences across all Pakistani universities. Additionally, the study's reliance on self-reporting introduces the potential for social desirability bias. The dynamic nature of technology and educational practices also means that the landscape may have evolved since the study's completion. Future research endeavors could address these limitations by incorporating larger, more diverse samples and employing a longitudinal design to capture evolving trends in online learning resource perceptions among Pakistani university students.

## References

- Abdelrady, A. H., & Akram, H. (2022). An empirical study of ClassPoint tool application in enhancing EFL students' online learning satisfaction. *Systems, 10*(5), 154.
- Abid, T., Zahid, G., Shahid, N., & Bukhari, M. (2021). Online teaching experience during the COVID-19 in Pakistan: Pedagogy–technology balance and student engagement. *Fudan Journal of the Humanities and Social Sciences, 14*, 367-391.
- Abubakar, M. K. (2021). Implementation and Use of Virtual Reference Services in Academic Libraries during and post COVID-19 Pandemic: A Necessity for Developing Countries. *Library Philosophy & Practice*.
- Adams, W. C. (2015). Conducting semi-structured interviews. *Handbook of practical program evaluation*, 492-505.
- Akram, H. (2020). Education governance in Pakistan: A critical analysis of challenges. *Journal of Social Sciences Advancement, 1*(1), 38-41.
- Akram, H., & Abdelrady, A. H. (2023). Application of ClassPoint tool in reducing EFL learners' test anxiety: an empirical evidence from Saudi Arabia. *Journal of Computers in Education*, 1-19.
- Akram, H., & Yang, Y. (2021). A critical analysis of the weak implementation causes on educational policies in Pakistan. *International Journal of Humanities and Innovation (IJHI), 4*(1), 25-28.

- Akram, H., Abdelrady, A. H., Al-Adwan, A. S., & Ramzan, M. (2022). Teachers' perceptions of technology integration in teaching-learning practices: A systematic review. *Frontiers in psychology, 13*, 920317.
- Akram, H., Aslam, S., Saleem, A., & Parveen, K. (2021). The challenges of online teaching in COVID-19 pandemic: A case study of public universities in Karachi, Pakistan. *Journal of Information Technology Education Research, 20*, 263.
- Akram, H., Yingxiu, Y., Al-Adwan, A. S., & Alkhalifah, A. (2021). Technology integration in higher education during COVID-19: An assessment of online teaching competencies through technological pedagogical content knowledge model. *Frontiers in psychology, 12*, 736522.
- Arifin, S. R. M. (2018). Ethical considerations in qualitative study. *International journal of care scholars, 1*(2), 30-33.
- Ashiq, M., Rehman, S. U., & Mujtaba, G. (2021). Future challenges and emerging role of academic libraries in Pakistan: A phenomenology approach. *Information Development, 37*(1), 158-173.
- Awoyemi, R. A., & Awoyemi, R. O. (2021). A mediated approach to the virtual learning environment (VLE): Implications for academic libraries in the 21st century. *International Journal of Library and Information Services (IJLIS), 10*(2), 1-10.
- Barrot, J. S., Llenares, I. I., & Del Rosario, L. S. (2021). Students' online learning challenges during the pandemic and how they cope with them: The case of the Philippines. *Education and information technologies, 26*(6), 7321-7338.
- Besser, A., Flett, G. L., & Zeigler-Hill, V. (2022). Adaptability to a sudden transition to online learning during the COVID-19 pandemic: Understanding the challenges for students. *Scholarship of Teaching and Learning in Psychology, 8*(2), 85.
- Brundy, C. (2015). Academic Libraries and Innovation: A Literature Review. *Journal of Library Innovation, 6*(1).
- Campbell, S., Greenwood, M., Prior, S., Shearer, T., Walkem, K., Young, S., ... & Walker, K. (2020). Purposive sampling: complex or simple? Research case examples. *Journal of research in Nursing, 25*(8), 652-661.
- Chen, Z., Ramzan, M. (2024). Analyzing the role of Facebook-based e-portfolio on motivation and performance in English as a second language learning *International Journal of English Language and Literature Studies, 12*(3), 123-138.
- Chiu, T. K. (2022). Applying the self-determination theory (SDT) to explain student engagement in online learning during the COVID-19 pandemic. *Journal of Research on Technology in Education, 54*(sup1), S14-S30.
- Farooq, F., Rathore, F. A., & Mansoor, S. N. (2020). Challenges of online medical education in Pakistan during COVID-19 pandemic. *J Coll Physicians Surg Pak, 30*(6), 67-9.
- Horton, J., Macve, R., & Struyven, G. (2004). Qualitative research: experiences in using semi-structured interviews. In *The real life guide to accounting research* (pp. 339-357). Elsevier.
- Iqbal, S. A., Ashiq, M., Rehman, S. U., Rashid, S., & Tayyab, N. (2022). Students' perceptions and experiences of online education in Pakistani Universities and Higher Education Institutes during COVID-19. *Education Sciences, 12*(3), 166.
- Li, S., & Akram, H. (2023). Do emotional regulation behaviors matter in EFL teachers' professional development? A process model approach. *Porta Linguarum Revista Interuniversitaria de Didáctica de las Lenguas Extranjeras, 273-291*.
- Mahmood, S. (2021). Instructional strategies for online teaching in COVID-19 pandemic. *Human behavior and emerging technologies, 3*(1), 199-203.
- Marshall, C., & Rossman, G. B. (2014). *Designing qualitative research*. Sage publications.
- Martin, F., Sun, T., & Westine, C. D. (2020). A systematic review of research on online teaching and learning from 2009 to 2018. *Computers & education, 159*, 104009.
- Martzoukou, K. (2021). Academic libraries in COVID-19: a renewed mission for digital literacy. *Library management, 42*(4/5), 266-276.
- Mustafa, F., Khursheed, A., Rizvi, S. M. U., Zahid, A., & Akhtar, A. (2021). Factors influencing online learning of university students under the covid-19 pandemic. *IJERI: International Journal of Educational Research and Innovation, 15*, 342-359.
- Noor, S., Ali, M. N., & Husnine, S. M. (2020). Performance of online classes in Lahore, Pakistan during Covid-19. *Performance Improvement, 59*(9), 33-42.
- Rabionet, S. E. (2011). How I learned to design and conduct semi-structured interviews: an ongoing and continuous journey. *Qualitative Report, 16*(2), 563-566.
- Ramzan, M., Oteir, I., Khan, M. A., Al-Otaibi, A., & Malik, S. (2023). English learning motivation of ESL learners from ethnic, gender, and cultural perspectives in sustainable development goals. *International Journal of English Language and Literature Studies, 12*(3), 195-212.

- Shah, I., Khan, A. T., Dogar, A. A., Elahi, N., & Rehan, U. (2021). Academic and socio-cultural constraints faced by international students in Pakistan: A case study of COMSATS University Islamabad, Abbottabad. *Ilkogretim Online*, 20(3), 83-93.
- Tabassum, F., Akram, N., & Moazzam, M. (2022). Online learning system in higher education institutions in Pakistan: Investigating problems faced by students during the COVID-19 pandemic. *International Journal of Web-Based Learning and Teaching Technologies (IJWLTT)*, 17(2), 1-15.
- Ullah, A., Ashraf, M., Ashraf, S., & Ahmed, S. (2021). Challenges of online learning during the COVID-19 pandemic encountered by students in Pakistan. *Journal of Pedagogical Sociology and Psychology*, 3(1), 36-44.
- Walsh, B., & Rana, H. (2020). Continuity of academic library services during the pandemic the University of Toronto libraries' response. *Journal of Scholarly Publishing*, 51(4), 237-245.