



## Duncan Black MacDonald's Intellectual Odyssey: A Critical Analysis of His Theological and Philosophical Contributions

Dr. Farhat Naseem Alvi<sup>1\*</sup>, Dr. Muhammad Raghib Hussain<sup>2</sup>, Maryam Raza<sup>3</sup>

### Abstract

From the very early days of Islam, its opponents tried to suppress the call for truth. Despite receiving an adequate and reasonable response, few of these opponents went beyond the limit instead of accepting the truth. This is still in practice by the people of same school of thought in modern times. But especially among Westerns, it took a form of irrational allegations. Most prominent of them were William Muire, and Margoliouth. Duncan Black MacDonald who tried to create misunderstandings through self-created assumptions upon the basic pillars of Islam as the very personality of Prophet Muhammad (SAW), state of revelation and Quran being a divine source. The Present research study is an analysis of the objections raised by D. B. MacDonald. He was a pioneering Scottish-American scholar whose work in Islamic studies and comparative theology left a significant mark on the academic landscape. His intellectual journey spanned a wide collection of disciplines, including theology, philosophy, and Islamic studies, positioning him as a crucial figure in the understanding of Islamic thought and its interactions with Western religious traditions. This research paper aims to present critical analysis of MacDonald's theological and philosophical contributions, examining the status of his irrational allegations.

**Keywords:** Prophet Muhammad (SAW), Holy Quran, MacDonald, Contributions, Allegations.

### 1. Introduction

Duncan Black MacDonald (d.1943 A.D.) was a well-known, enterprising, erudite scholar and Orientalist. He was born on April 9, 1863 at Glasgow, Scotland.<sup>1</sup> He received his early education at the University of Glasgow. His academic pursuits led him to the University of Edinburgh, where he studied under prominent intellectuals of the time. Initially, he began his long career at the Hartford as an instructor of Semitic languages in the Department of Exegetical Theology at the age of 29 in 1892. He accepted an invitation from President Hartford in 1892 to become instructor in Semitic languages at Hartford Theological Seminary, and got reputation as one of the enthusiastic bands of young scholars in the early nineties.<sup>2</sup> He acquired a status as a scholar in the fields of Islamic theology and religious thoughts. He raises irrational objection against Islam. He claims that early Islamic law was rigid and scholastic before the influence the philosophy of Imam al-Ghazali. He argues that Islamic practices involving singing and music are controversial and have led to various interpretations and emotional responses. He also questions about protection of Quranic text in the early days of Islam. He falsely claims that Quranic texts were collected from previous scriptures. He ties to target personality of prophet Muhammad (SAW) in his writings.

This research work discusses the historical and ongoing opposition to Islam, focusing on criticisms from scholar MacDonald. Since the early days of Islam, there have been attempts to suppress its universal message. Despite Islam providing adequate and reasonable responses to these criticisms, some enemies have continued to criticize the faith. This hostility persists, particularly among certain Western scholars who make irrational allegations against Islam. Notable among these critics a significant figure is Duncan Black MacDonald, who tried his best to create misunderstandings about basic Islamic beliefs, such as the character of holy Prophet Muhammad (SAW), revelation, and the Qur'an as a divine source. The present research work analyzes the objections on the origin of Islam raised by Duncan Black MacDonald. It provides an analysis of his role as a pioneering scholar in Islamic studies and comparative theology, noting his impact on the academic study of Islam and its interactions with Western religious traditions.

### 2. Literature Review

Duncan Black MacDonald's work in the field of Islamic literature and comparative theology has garnered significant scholarly attention. His philosophical contributions were scholarly criticized in numerous academic texts, research articles, and reviews. MacDonald's "Development of Muslim Theology, Jurisprudence and Constitutional Theory"<sup>3</sup> is a seminal work that offers a comprehensive examination of the evolution of Islamic thought. The text discovers the historical development of Islamic theology (kalam), jurisprudence (fiqh), and constitutional theory, highlighting the intricate relationships between these domains. Western scholars consider his work as pioneering in drawing parallels and highlighting divergences between Islamic and Christian theological traditions. Western scholars think that

<sup>1\*</sup> Chairperson, Department of Islamic Studies, University of Sargodha, [Farhat.naseem@uos.edu.pk](mailto:Farhat.naseem@uos.edu.pk)

<sup>2</sup> Chairman Council of Islamic Ideology, Pakistan

<sup>3</sup> Lecturer, university of Sargodha

MacDonald's comparative analyses fostered a deeper understanding of the complexities within both traditions and encouraged a more nuanced appreciation of their unique contributions to theological discourse. A well-known orientalist William Montgomery Watt<sup>4</sup> credits MacDonald with inspiring a generation of scholars to approach Islamic theology with respect and scholarly rigor.

MacDonald's exploration of Sufi mysticism, particularly in "The Religious Attitude and Life in Islam"<sup>5</sup> has been a significant subject of scholarly discussion. Carl W. Ernst<sup>6</sup> praises MacDonald for his detailed examination of Sufism, which he regards as pivotal in bringing the mystical dimensions of Islam to the attention of Western scholars. Ernst argues that MacDonald's work contributed to a broader recognition of the philosophical richness of Sufism. Various scholars also critically analyze MacDonald's engagement with Muslim philosophers such as Al-Ghazali and Ibn Arabi. Annemarie Schimmel<sup>7</sup> presents MacDonald's insightful analyses of these thinkers' metaphysical, ethical, and epistemological contributions. Schimmel praises MacDonald for demonstrating the relevance of Islamic philosophy to broader philosophical discourses, thereby bridging cultural and academic divides.

In the realm of comparative philosophy, MacDonald's work noted for its interdisciplinary aspect. Majid Fakhry<sup>8</sup> has observed that MacDonald's comparative analyses provided a framework for understanding the intersections between Islamic and Western philosophical traditions. Fakhry argues that this approach was instrumental in promoting a more integrated and comprehensive study of philosophy across cultural boundaries. Despite his philosophical contributions, MacDonald's work has not been without criticism. Edward Said's book "Orientalism"<sup>9</sup> has criticized subsequent evaluations of MacDonald's work. Wael Hallaq<sup>10</sup> argues that MacDonald's reliance on Orientalist frameworks occasionally led to a skewed perception of Islamic thought, noticed through a predominantly Western lens. This critique underscores the need to contextualize MacDonald's work within the rational paradigms of his time. According to John L. Esposito<sup>11</sup> MacDonald laid the groundwork for interfaith dialogue and promoted a more inclusive approach to religious studies. Esposito claims that MacDonald's contributions remain relevant in contemporary efforts to understand and appreciate the diversity of religious thought. Western thought and culture is being injected in Muslim societies by western media in modern times. Western media is playing role of orientalism. Research article "Impact of Western Civilization in Muslim Societies and Transgender Act: A Critical View"<sup>12</sup> highlights practice of western thought and culture in Muslim societies. No doubt, imitation of western culture is destabilizing bases of Islamic social system in current times.

The literature on Duncan Black MacDonald's theological and philosophical contributions reflects an extensive consensus on his significant impact on Islamic studies and comparative theology. While his work has been subject to critical scrutiny, particularly concerning Orientalist frameworks. Irrational objections of orientalists demand a comprehensive critical analysis to inspire Muslim scholars and foster a deeper understanding of the Macdonald's thought about Islamic literature.

### 3. Research Methodology

The research methodology for this article involves a systematic approach to analyze critically Duncan Black MacDonald's philosophical contributions about Islamic literature. This methodology ensures a thorough and objective analysis of MacDonald's work, incorporating both qualitative and quantitative research techniques. The research design for this research work is primarily qualitative, utilizing a combination of historical analysis, content analysis, and comparative analysis. These research methods provide a holistic understanding of MacDonald's work and its impact on the fields of Islamic studies and comparative theology. The English Translation of Quranic texts has been taken from Mufti Taqi Usmani's<sup>13</sup> English Translation of Holy Quran.

#### 3.1. Theological and Philosophical Contributions

The lasting impact of MacDonald's work on the field of Islamic studies is a recurring theme in the literature. Here is a table summarizing the key theological contributions of Duncan Black MacDonald:

No.	Contribution	Description	Key Works
1	Exploration of Muslim Theology	Tried to explore Islamic theological thought and its evolution	Development of Muslim Theology, Jurisprudence and Constitutional Theory
2	Comparative Study	Juxtaposition of Islamic and Christian theological traditions	Various publications and lectures
3	Mysticism (Sufism)	Detailed discussion of Sufism and its philosophical underpinnings	The Religious Attitude and Life in Islam
4	Study of Islamic Philosophers	Analysis of contributions Muslim philosophers (Al-Ghazali, Ibn Arabi)	Various scholarly studies
5	Exploration of Various elements of Islam	Described the prominence of both religious and cultural aspects of Islam	Aspects of Islam

6	Influence on Subsequent Scholars	Mentored and motivated future scholars	Working at Hartford Theological Seminary
7	Theological Dynamics and Context	Emphasized the socio-political contexts influencing theological developments	Highlighting Muslim Theology, Jurisprudence and Constitutional Theory
8	Interfaith Dialogue	Encouraged dialogue between scholars of different faiths	Various public lectures and writings

MacDonald's contributions to Islamic theology had a profound and lasting impact on Western intellectuals. Scholars and orientalists consider that his works remain influential, providing foundational insights and fostering a deeper understanding of the interconnectedness of religious traditions. Muslim scholars should examine his key contributions in the fields of Islamic studies, mysticism (Sufism), Quranic scripture and comparative theology with critical approach.

### 3.2. Critical Analysis of Macdonald's Work

MacDonald put several efforts to introduce the policies for teaching methodology for higher classes and the degree for doctor of philosophy at Hartford Theological Seminary. These norms and reforms were the implication of his prolonged pedagogic and academic experience. His educational policies and experiences got recognition later on at other places for theological studies as in Asia and Africa. So, in this way his policies gathered grave admiration by his successors and the missionaries as:

"It should be recorded that. Dr. Macdonald had a vital share in originating and moulding the unique methods employed by the Kennedy School in granting the degree of Doctor of Philosophy to candidates who prove their quality, both in scholarship and in capacity for research work, on the mission field. These methods were used with special thoroughness by Dr. Macdonald in his teaching, and have resulted in the publication of books in his own field which he views with satisfaction. These methods have now been adopted elsewhere and are contributing powerfully to increase the efficiency of many missionaries in Asia and Africa."

The Prophet Muhammad (SAW)'s biography has also commanded great inclination in the West. During the nineteenth century, the Prophet Muhammad (SAW) was the main figure of attack by Christian priests and propagandists, whom we might address as real Orientalists. He was denounced; his personality was disfigured and he was given absurd names like Mahoun.<sup>14</sup> He was accused of being an imposter, a Christian heretic and a pathological case. It was during the nineteenth and first half of the twentieth century, however, that he produced the greatest interest among the Orientalists. A vast literature was introduced "to discover" Muhammad (SAW).

The question of the status and prophet hood of the Prophet Muhammad (SAW) has been one of the most critical and contradictory issues, in the history of Christian-Muslim relations. It has been keenly observed that D.B. MacDonald has the same notions and approaches about the personality of Holy Prophet Muhammad (SAW) as his predecessors had. He echoes previous European attacks on the Prophet's personality in a more lucid and sophisticated manner, using a psychological approach. First he attempts a question about the personality and physical condition of the Prophet Muhammad (SAW) in his book "Aspects of Islam" as under:

"What of Muhammad himself? Is it possible to express him in his essential personality and character with certainty in a word?"

Similarly, many other Orientalists who specialized in the prophet's Sirah and the subject of revelation, the writer also proceeds to tell that the prophet's revelation was the product of his sub-conscious. He (MacDonald) considers that Muhammad (SAW) was not a normal human being; rather he was a pathological case as he describes:

"I think that it is. If there is one thing that is certain about him, his character, his personality, it is that he was essentially a pathological case."

In this context, MacDonald has significantly attempted to prove that (God forbids) the Prophet Muhammad (SAW) was a pathological case and suffering mental disorders.

"If we look at him, further, on the side of philosophy, his case is equally strange, equally contradictory. Again we must go back to our clue, to the essentially pathological state of his mind.... His mind, on one side, was of the crassest concreteness."

Duncan Black MacDonald considers the Prophet (SAW) as a pathological case but he doesn't illustrate his ideas at large. Anyhow, if we proceed to investigate this matter, we find other Western scholars' concept about the personality of the Prophet that he was epileptic patient as A.T. Welch is of the opinion that the graphic descriptions of Muhammad's (SAW) condition in this era may be regarded as genuine since they are unlikely to have been discovered by later Muslims. According to A. T. Welch, these seizures should have been the most convincing evidence for the superhuman origin of Muhammad's (SAW) inspirations for people around him.<sup>15</sup>

The Orientalists have presented their non-scientific claims in the name of science. They did so in order to delude those who are ignorant of the symptoms of the epileptic disease and unaware of the state of revelation of the Prophet Muhammad (SAW). A consultation of medical literature about epilepsy will quickly expose the blunders of the

Orientalists and make the crystal clear differences between the epileptic conditions and the conditions of the revelation on the Prophet Muhammad (SAW).

We, at first, diagnose the causes of epilepsy and its symptoms. Jerome Engel Jr. the Director of the Epilepsy Telemetry Unit Seizure Disorder Center, United States, says:

“The word epilepsy is derived from the Greek verb “ἐπίληψία” (epilamvanein) (“to be seized,” “to be taken hold of,” or “to be attacked”)…Epilepsy is, of course, not a specific disease, or even a single syndrome but rather a broad category of symptom complexes arising from any number of disordered brain functions that themselves may be secondary to a variety of pathologic processes.”<sup>16</sup>

He (Jerome Engel Jr.) further says about the symptoms of epilepsy:

“The terms convulsive disorder, seizure disorder and cerebral seizures are used synonymously with epilepsy: they all refer to recurrent paroxysmal episodes of brain dysfunction manifested by stereotyped alterations in behavior.”<sup>17</sup>

Epilepsy is a brain disorder in which clusters of nerve cells, or neurons, sometimes, in the brain, signals become abnormal. Neurons normally generate electrochemical impulses that act on other neurons, glands and muscles to produce human thoughts, feelings and actions. In epilepsy, the normal pattern of neuronal activity becomes disturbed, causing strange sensations, emotions, and behavior, or sometimes convulsions, muscle spasms and loss of consciousness. Such are the symptoms of epilepsy as science has established them.

In revelation, an intense and penetrating consciousness establishes with full knowledge, conviction and contact with the supernal authority that enables the prophet to report and convey his revelation. While epilepsy, on the other hand, stops cognition. It reduces its patient to a mechanical state devoid of either feeling or sensation.

The fit of epilepsy leaves the patient utterly without memory of what has taken place. That was not the case at all with the Prophet Muhammad (SAW) at the moment of revelation, for his cognitive faculties used to be strengthened. Muhammad (SAW) used to remember with utmost precision what he received by way of revelation and recited it to his companions without a flaw.

The historical fact is that the contemporaries of the Prophet (SAW) were well informed of the disease epilepsy along with its symptoms. In fact, the Prophet Muhammad (SAW) himself was already aware of epilepsy, as it is demonstrated in this hadith as narrated by Al-Bukhari:

”حَدَّثَنَا مُسَدَّدٌ حَدَّثَنَا يَحْيَى عَنْ عَفْرَانَ أَبِي بَكْرٍ قَالَ حَتَّىٰ عَطَائِي بْنُ أَبِي رَيَاحٍ قَالَ قَالَ لِي أَنُّ عَلَيْسَ أَلَا أَرِيكَ أَمْرًا مِّنْ أَهْلِ الْحَيَّةِ فَلَمْ تَلِي قَالَ لِي فَذَهَبَ الْمَرْأَةُ السُّوَدَّاءِ أَتَتْ النَّبِيَّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ فَقَالَتْ إِنِّي أَصْرَعُ وَإِنِّي أَنْكَثُ فَأَذْعُ اللَّهَ لِي قَالَ إِنْ شِئْتُ صَبَرْتُ وَلَكِ الْجَنَّةُ وَإِنْ شِئْتُ دَعَوْتُ اللَّهَ أَنْ يُعَافِيَكِ فَقَالَتْ أَصْرَعُ فَقَالَتْ إِنِّي أَنْكَثُ فَأَذْعُ اللَّهَ لِي أَنْ لَا أَنْكَثَ فَدَعَاهَا 18“

If He (prophet Muhammad (SAW) was the patient of epilepsy, then his contemporaries were well aware of this disease, but they did not raise uproar against him. It is vital evidence that he was not an epileptic patient.

D. B. MacDonald makes another allegation at the Prophet as a poet<sup>19</sup> and soothsayer<sup>20</sup> in his book. He was not a divine entity as he describes:

“Muhammad (SAW) was, in truth, no theologian. Muhammad (SAW) was simply a God-intoxicated poet.”<sup>21</sup>

He makes again another charge at the prophet (SAW). He used the word “jerky language” and now he is going to explain it that “jerky language” is the language of soothsayers of Arabia and the prophet’s language and his external appearance was that of soothsayers as he says under:

All is in exactly the form of language that was used in heathen Arabia by the soothsayers.... The jerky utterances are theirs; the rhymes are theirs; all is stamped with their stamp throughout... He spoke the language of the soothsayers; in every respect, his external appearance was that of the soothsayers.<sup>22</sup>

Holy Quran states irrational allegations of opponents as under:

”قَالُوا يَا بَشِّرَ الَّذِي نَزَّلَ عَلَيْهِ الْكِتَابَ إِنَّكَ لِمَجْنُونٌ“<sup>23</sup>

“They say, O you to whom the Dhikr (the Qur‘an) has been revealed, you are surely insane.”

They accused him as magician. Their hostility is clearly described in Holy Quran.

Quran states it as under:

”وَعَجَّوْا أَنْ جَاءَهُمْ مُنْذِرٌ مِّنْهُمْ وَقَالَ لِكَافِرِنَّ هَذَا سَاحِرٌ كَذَابٌ“<sup>24</sup>

“They (the pagans) wonder that a warner has come to them from among themselves. And the disbelievers say, this is a magician, a sheer liar.”

Allah denied it and clarified that his prophet (SAW) was neither a poet nor a soothsayer as mentioned in Qur‘an:

”وَمَا هُوَ بِقَوْلِ شَاعِرٍ قَلِيلًا مَا تَؤْمِنُونَ لَا بِقَوْلِ كَاهِنٍ قَلِيلًا مَا تَنْكِرُونَ تَنْزِيلٌ مِّنْ رَبِّ الْعَالَمِينَ“<sup>25</sup>

“And it is not the speech of a poet, (but) little you believe, nor is it the speech of a soothsayer, (but) little you heed to the advice. It is a revelation from the Lord of the worlds.”

Holy Quran presents their refutation in following verse:

”وَمَا عَلِمْنَاهُ شِعْرًا وَمَا يَنْبَغِي لَهُ إِنْ هُوَ إِلَّا ذِكْرٌ وَقُرْآنٌ مُّبِينٌ“<sup>26</sup>

“We did not teach him (the Holy Prophet) poetry, and it is not proper for him. It is nothing (of that sort,) but (it is) an advice and a readable book that explains (the Truth).”

‘Utba bin Rabia who is a remarkable figure among the Quraish, was sent to the Prophet Muhammad (SAW) by putting an end to the preaching of Islam. After a detailed conversation, he advised his people as:

"إنه قد سمعت قولاً والله ما سمعت مثله قط، والله ما هو بالشعر، ولا بالسحر، ولا بالكمانة." 27

“By God! I have listened such a glorious discourse that never been listened, surely, this is not poetry, not sorcery and not clairvoyance.”

Apparently the entity, who was carrying out this message, is the noblest person of Arabian society and morally he is good breaded and has a highly esteemed conduct towards every walk of life. So, it is impossible for such a person to produce a false statement and ascribe it to Allah.

It is also clear that the prophet (SAW) has revolutionized the lives of his followers. A poet or a soothsayer did not have such convincing effect in his conversation that injected his followers an ethical spirit. It created tolerance in his followers to face every kind of tribulation in the way of truth.

Duncan Black MacDonald also claimed that the prophet Muhammad (SAW) didn't pay any heed on preserving the sacred and divine book Quran. If preservation and compilation of Qur'an is as necessary as being taken seriously by his followers on this matter after his demise, he certainly would have done this obligation in his life-time. On the contrary, it seems that he didn't even bother on this matter as MacDonald describes:

“Another strange point is that though Muhammad (SAW) gave out these as being the direct words of Allah to himself, he does not seem to have taken any pain at all about the preservation of them. Yet he speaks, again and again, of a Book as being revealed through him, although he seems to have given no care to build up such a book out of what came to him.”<sup>28</sup>

He further narrates that there is no record found showing this truth that Prophet Muhammad (SAW) paid no attention for preservation of the revelation through writing as under:

<sup>29</sup>“At any rate, we have no record whatever that he gave care to have the words of Allah reduced to writing.”

This fake claim of MacDonald is beyond the reality. One thing that ought to be remembered in connection with the preservation of the Qur'an, it was accomplished through memory and writing. Through this verse it is affirmed that it is the sole responsibility of Allah Almighty to preserve Qur'an and to make your oral faculties recite it. So, the prophet (SAW) ought to have listened it silently while it is revealing as under:

“O Prophet, do not move your tongue (during revelation) for (reciting) it (the Qur‘an) to receive it in hurry. It is surely undertaken by Us to store it (in your heart), and to let it be recited (by you after revelation is completed).”

"وَأَنْذِ لَتْ عَلَيْكَ كِتَابًا لَا يَخْسِلُهُ الْمَاءُ."<sup>31</sup>

“I sent the Book to you which cannot be washed away by water.”

This meant that Qur'an will not be preserved only in written form but also in some other medium as well.

William Graham writes in his book "Beyond the Written Word" about memorization of Quran as under:

“The Quran is perhaps the only book, religious or secular, that has been memorized completely by the millions of Muslims.”<sup>32</sup>

In the meanwhile, emphasis on preservation of Quran relied on writings as well as on oral methodology. In this regard one can find exiting Evidences on this point as well. Hence, Zaid bin Thabit's (R.A.) resided near by the Prophet's Mosque, he (R.A.) was often summoned as it is described in a Hadith as under:

Michael Zwettler notes: "In ancient times, when writing was scarcely used, memory and oral transmission was exercised and strengthened to a degree now almost unknown."<sup>34</sup>

He (MacDonald) again produces doubts on the origin of the Qur'an and begins his conversation by asking a question as under:

### “What is the Qur'an?”<sup>35</sup>

He is of the opinion that the Quran is an asinine collection of some scrap of history that has been gathered up from fragments in an anachronistic way. As he himself answers this question:

"The Quran is simply a collection of fragments gathered up from those trance utterances of Muhammad. When we look at it, as it is in itself, we find that it is an absolute chaos, yet a chaos, curiously enough, with a mechanical arrangement."<sup>36</sup>

He further gives remarks that Quran is a collection consisted of diminutive, atrocious, abrasive language with winding sentences, “clumsy” and “lumbering” in sequence:

"We find a great many of them couched in short, broken, jerky language, and we find a great many others couched in long, winding sentences, clumsy and lumbering to the last degree."<sup>37</sup>

D.B. MacDonald also comments that information derived from previous scriptures were utilized in text of the Quran.

"The way that such things came to him seems to have been very much like this: He got a scrap of history; he got an allusion; he got a telling phrase; he got a hint of a character. He carried that away, and then with that as a center and with his broad idea of the story—generally a very inaccurate idea—as material, he built up for himself again what he had heard".<sup>38</sup>

Similarly, he opines that the Quran is a Judo-Christian origin and he says his notion as under in these words: "It may have been some scrap of the Scriptures which he had heard once or twice; some bit which he had picked up from hearing the Psalms read; something he had heard at a Christian service of worship, a phrase, perhaps, from the chanting of the Magnificat; there were many fragments of that kind of which the words had caught his memory."<sup>39</sup> In this connection, the first name highlighted by Western scholars, is Warqa bin Naufal. The historical accounts narrate that Muhammad (PBUH) met Warqa bin Naufal twice in his life. Warqa was an old man who was blind during the last years of his life.

□ Their first meeting occurred when Warqa was going around the K'aba and saw Muhammad (SAW). He affectionately kissed his head (as he felt that Muhammad (SAW) would grow to be a special person).

□ The second meeting was held after Muhammad (SAW) had received the first revelation. He was terrified and his beloved wife Khadija (RA) took him to her cousin Warqa.<sup>40</sup>

During the early stages of revelation in Makkah, the Qur'an emphasized on strengthening the fundamental beliefs of monotheism and abolishment of idol worshipping. The religious dogmatic doctrines, principles, constitutional laws and the details of the Islamic code of life were disclosed in the later stages of revelation after Muhammad (SAW) emigrated to Madina. Warqa bin Naufal could not be the source of Quran by these facts: The Prophet's (SAW) meeting with Warqa bin Naufal, along with the entire dialogue held between Warqa bin Naufal and the Prophet (SAW) in both meetings is historically recorded. If the Prophet (SAW) had sought some information about the religious matters from the Warqa bin Naufal, it would have narrated by the historians. Contrary to it, entire clan of the historians is silent about this matter.

The point is to be noted that Warqa died three years later while the revelation continued for twenty more years.<sup>41</sup>

All the Orientalists remained muted in this matter because they are incompetent to produce a single precedence of discussion through which they argued with Jews and Christians about Islam for improving Quranic text. It is, therefore, explicitly evident that Warqa bin Naufal could not be the source of the Quran.

#### 4. Conclusion

Duncan Black MacDonald's theological and philosophical contributions has a significant impact on Islamic studies and comparative theology. His work has been subject to critical scrutiny, particularly concerning Orientalist frameworks, its enduring relevance and influence are widely acknowledged by Western scholars and orientalists. It is an amazing that, at one side, Macdonald established a claim about these entire hypothesis but at the same time, he also avowedly confessed this truth that significance of critical and analytical work conducted by Muslim scholars on the personality of Muhammad (SAW), Quran, its origin and its preservation in the prophet's era. Thus, it is unparalleled point of view presented by MacDonald. It is clear that he and other Western scholars/orientalists had no dexterity and capacity to exercise this sort of work on it. All the suppositions, misinterpretations of the text and conjectural work indicate irrational and anti-Islamic approach of Western scholars. It has been observed that each of the false illustrations and accusations are illogical and irrational, and having perverted understanding, erroneous view and unfledged competency.

#### References

Mackenzie, W. D. (1933). Duncan Black MacDonald; Scholar, Teacher and Author. *The Macdonald Presentation Volume*, Princeton University Press, pp. 2, 3, 5.

MacDonald, D. B. (1903). Development of Muslim Theology, Jurisprudence and Constitutional Theory. C. Scribner's Sons, Vol. 9, pp. 23-45.

Watt, W. M. (1973). Formative Period of Islamic Thought. Edinburgh University Press, pp. 67-89.

MacDonald, D. B. (1909). The Religious Attitude and Life in Islam: Being the Haskell Lectures on Comparative Religion Delivered Before the University of Chicago in 1906. University of Chicago Press, pp. 12-34.

Ernst, C. W. (1997). The Shambhala Guide to Sufism. Shambhala, pp. 45-78.

Schimmel, A. (1975). Mystical Dimensions of Islam. University of North Carolina Press, pp. 89-112.

Fakhry, M. (2004). A History of Islamic Philosophy. Columbia University Press, pp. 123-145.

Said, E. (1978). Orientalism. Pantheon Books, pp. 56-78.

Hallaq, W. (2009). An Introduction to Islamic Law. Cambridge University Press, pp. 90-112.

Esposito, J. L. (2010). The Future of Islam. Oxford University Press, pp. 67-89.

Alvi, F. N., & Cheema, A. M. (2024). Impact of Western Civilization in Muslim Societies and Transgender Act: A Critical View. *Al Basirah*, 13(1), 11-23. Retrieved from <https://albasirah.numl.edu.pk/index.php/alb/article/view/181>.

Usmani, M. T. (2020). The Noble Quran: Meaning with Explanatory Notes. Turath Publishing, pp. 101-123.

Welch, A. T. (n.d.). Encyclopedia of Islam (Vol. 4, p. 400). E.J. Brill, pp. 400-423.

Engel, J., Jr., & Pedley, T. A. (2008). Epilepsy: A Comprehensive Textbook (Vol. 1). Cambridge University Press, pp. 1-15.

Al-Bukhari, M. I. (1422 AH). Al-Sahih al-Bukhari (Vol. 2). Dar Tauq al-Naja, pp. 116, H. 5652.

Ibn Hisham. (1995). Al-Sirat al-Nabawiyya (Vol. 2). Mustafa Al-Babi Al-Halabi and Sons Printing Press, pp. 293-294.

Muslim ibn al-Hajjaj. (n.d.). Sahih Muslim (Vol. 4). Dar Ihya al-Turath ul-Arabi, pp. 2197, H. 2865.

Graham, W. (1993). Beyond the Written Word. Cambridge University Press, pp. 80-101.

Zwettler, M. (1978). The Oral Tradition of Classical Arabic Poetry. Ohio State Press, pp. 14-36.

Gibb, H. A. R., & Kraers, J. H. (1951). Encyclopaedia of Islam. E.J. Brill, pp. 112-133.

Ammermann, P. A., Runyon, L. R., & Conceicao, R. (2011). A new quantitative approach for the management of a student-managed investment fund. *Managerial Finance*, 37(7), 624-635.